

CIVIL SERVICES OF PAKISTAN

A PROPOSED FRAMEWORK

RATIONALE FOR THE CIVIL SERVICE REFORM.

A competent, effective and neutral Civil Service is the backbone of any country's governance structure. Countries that do not have an Organized Civil Service system are at a relative disadvantage in executing their programs and policies. Pakistan was fortunate in having inherited a steel frame for its bureaucracy from the British. The purpose and motivation of the British in developing and supporting this steel frame were quite different from the requirements of an independent and sovereign country. This steel frame could, however, have been modified to suit and adapt to changed circumstances but there was not much point in dismantling the structure itself which had been built over a century. The major difficulty in the post independence period in Pakistan lay in the inability to replace the colonial practice of empowering the privileged class of executive/ bureaucratic system by a new democratic system of governance at local levels. The historical record of political institutional evolution in Pakistan is quite weak and that has had its toll on the quality of civil service overtime. The boundaries between policy making and execution got blurred, the equilibrium in working relationship between the Minister and Civil Servants remained shaky and uneasy and the sharing of decision making space remained contested and unsettled. The patrimonial state model with its attendant mai-bap culture and patronage dispensation mechanism remains intact in its essence although the form has changed many times over. The broadening of privileged class by the inclusion of military bureaucracy and political elites has only reinforced the patrimonial tendencies.

2. There is a general consensus that the performance of the Civil Service in terms of output, efficiency, neutrality, objectivity and attitude towards common citizens does no longer meet either the standards set by the British or the exigencies of the new state. The same set of complaints is also reverberated in India that has preserved the same structure of the Civil Service as inherited at the time of their independence. The significant social development gap and stark inequities despite impressive macroeconomic performance in both India and Pakistan provide ample testimony, inter-alia to the inadequacy of the governance structures in place and the failure of delivery of basic public services to the poor and non-elite classes.

3. Before a reform package is proposed it is essential to identify the causes for weaknesses in the existing system, processes and practices. The gradual deterioration in the capacity of Civil Servants overtime can be ascribed to a number of factors. The most important factors that have been identified in the previous Commission/ Committee reports and studies on Civil Service can be recapitulated here. These are:

- (i) absence of a long term human resource development and management policy has resulted in a neglect in harnessing the potential of Civil Servants, and providing a transparent, predictable, level playing field for all civil servants.
- (ii) civil servants have by and large become risk averse individuals who avoid taking timely decisions as the fear of catering to the personal whims of the ruling classes rather than observing the supremacy of the rule of law prevails most of the time,
- (iii) pressures and compulsions from the political leadership in power push the ambitious Civil Servants into taking partisan positions favouring the ruling party rather than adopt a neutral stance,
- (iv) a small group of encadred Civil Servants has been given preferences for training, development, promotion and status, to the exclusion of a large majority of civil servants particularly professionals and technical experts,
- (v) decision making has become highly over centralized and fear of delegating powers to the lower tiers is highly pervasive,
- (vi) Rapid turnover and transfers of key Civil Servants particularly in Police and District Administration at the behest of the politicians in power has adversely affected implementation capacity and equality of access,
- (vii) Less than adequate compensation packages have encouraged widespread rent-seeking activities by the civil servants, particularly at lower levels where most of the interactions take place between citizens and the government functionaries,
- (viii) creation of isolated parallel project units and organizations for meeting donors conditionalities has fragmented and weakened the existing capacity of civil service,
- (ix) reliance on antiquated and outdated rules, procedures and regulations has led to failure in adapting to the changed circumstances and in adopting a problem solving attitude,
- (x) turf fighting and self preservation, perpetually adversarial relationship and silo like mentality among the different ministries, between the Federal and the Provincial Governments and between the Provincial and District Governments delay grievance redressal and confuse the citizens,

- (xi) redressal grievance and complaint resolution mechanisms by the citizens against civil servants remain un-satisfactory and time consuming despite existence of the Federal and Provincial Ombudsman's offices.
- (xii) absence of internal accountability for the results and outcomes and convoluted and formalistic accountability before the public have taken away the incentives for improving performance and behavior.

4. Pakistan in response to these weaknesses has brought about major structural changes at various points of time. However, the most prominent among them were introduced in 1973 and later in 2001. It is important to evaluate the impact and efficacy of the major changes in Civil Service structure introduced in 1973 and 2001 before developing the approach to civil service reforms. The time elapsed since 1973 has been more than three decades and therefore the evidence and analysis can be relied upon with some degree of confidence. The period since 2001 is still a period of transition and all the stipulated changes have not yet been put in place. Therefore the analysis has to be more tentative and the conclusions more cautious.

5. The intent of the 1973 reforms has not been fulfilled in practice as only the quasi – monopoly of the former Civil Service of Pakistan (CSP) in apportionment and allocation of high level positions was substituted by the quasi monopoly of all the cadres recruited through the Central Superior Services (CSS). The majority of the Civil Servants in the ex-cadre or non-cadre jobs who formed the core of service delivery and technical expertise within the Government remained outside this small elite group and is not treated at par with the established cadres, services and occupational groups. The majority of officers outside the C.S.S recruited cadres and groups have limited opportunities for career advancement or progression to top managerial positions. The resultant de-motivation, de-moralization and despondency among the majority of the Civil Servants are reflected in poor service delivery to the citizens, attitudes of indifference and apathy towards their clients and a mindset that inculcates risk aversion, indecision and self-preservation at all costs. Paradoxically, the members of the cadres and services are equally unhappy. The induction of officers through lateral entry was resented by the incumbents as the process of selection was considered politically motivated. Thus the 1973 changes have not succeeded in bringing about the intended impact of the reforms.

6. The 2001 system of the devolution to local governments is more wide ranging than previous attempts made by Ayub and Zia Governments. The most significant change was that under the new system the posts of Deputy Commissioners and Commissioners were abolished and replaced by the elected Nazims as head of the District Administration with greater powers and autonomy. This new system has begun to bring about positive change in so far as the

priorities and choices for development projects are now determined by the representatives of the communities and intended beneficiaries of those projects. But those reforms have also created a void in the areas of law and order, disaster and natural calamities management, revenue administration – to name a few. The public-at-large yearn for a one-stop politically neutral but legally empowered representative of the Government at the District or Tehsil level who can listen to their grievances and get them relief and justice. In case of violation of their fundamental rights or police excesses they could approach an individual who symbolized the writ of the state. The Nazim, who is an elected representative, has his strong political likes and dislikes and therefore is not perceived as a neutral symbol of the state power or authority. At times his opponents feel, rightly or wrongly, that they will not get justice and fair play as long as the Nazim is in power. The already existing polarization and divisiveness among the communities living together on the basis of biradris, sects and ethnicity has been further compounded by the divisions caused by political affiliations. Police force is neither trusted by the non influential and common citizen nor has any checks against its arbitrary and discretionary powers. Examples range from collusion between the Nazim and Police on one hand to open confrontation between the two. In very few instances a proper balance is struck. The MNAs, MPAs Ministers elected from those districts are also unhappy as they believe they have lost out on influence and authority in their own constituencies due to the dominant role assigned to the Nazims viz-a-viz the police. Under these conflicting pressures the role of District Police Officers and the SHOs has become even more contentious.

7. The parallel reforms through the Police Order 2002 have not yet been fully implemented and the transition from the old order to the new has not been managed carefully. Some of the amendments introduced at the behest of the Provincial Governments after 2003 have introduced anomalies and internal inconsistencies. The uncertainties and dislocations in law enforcement have therefore become much stark. The whole value chain of administration of justice – prevention, surveillance and intelligence, detection, reporting and registration, investigation, prosecution, adjudication, prison and rehabilitation – needs to be considered as a continuum and requires strengthening. A report incorporating extensive suggestions for improving the Police Administration has been approved by the NCGR after consultations with the Provincial and Federal officials and will be submitted to the Steering Committee at the next meeting.

8. In case of the breakdown of law and order there is a lot of ambiguity, lack of clarity and operational difficulty in identifying the locus of responsibility for action. . The District Nazim have generally been found to be reluctant or hesitant to take tough actions against encroachers, illegal processions and other violations of law as they feel they will have to face consequences of their actions at the time of elections. This inherent conflict of interest between the need to

take timely and tough actions at the time of breakdown in law and order and the instinct of elected Nazims to survive politically and avoid incurring the wrath of some of their constituents is a serious unresolved issue. The present trend to upscale the decision making to the level of the Provincial Government in case of breakdown of law and order in a district is neither feasible nor likely to be effective. There is hardly any substitute for local knowledge local contacts and local mitigants. Remote control decisions will always remain fraught with high risks of errors in human judgment arising from lack of a complete understanding of local environment and the interplay between the various players.

9. Similarly, in the recent cases of earthquake, floods and other disasters the Armed Forces had to play the leadership role as the capacity at the district level to meet these exigencies has been eroded. The experience of Earthquake Relief and Rehabilitation Authority (ERRA) and the scope of activities of the newly formed National Disaster Management Agency (NAMA) should be studied to develop a timely and effective response capacity at the District level which has been eroded.

10. The District Coordination Officer (DCO) who now enjoys the powers to supervise the officers of other departments in the District is popularly perceived to be the logical successor to the Deputy Commissioner but no longer enjoys the same powers. This gap between the expectations of the citizens and the actual capacity of DCO to deliver causes frustration. This is a natural outcome in a country where two-thirds of the population lives in the rural areas and three out of five persons living in these areas are illiterate and highly dependent on the Government for their day to day survival. The separation of judiciary from the Executive is a welcome step in the right direction. However, practical experience has demonstrated that the matters of price controls, removal of encroachments, enforcement of municipal laws etc. could be satisfactorily resolved only when the powers were conferred upon the Executive Officers by the High Court or by the legislation such as the Finance Act.

11. In several districts, revenue records have been tampered as a result of collusion between the Nazim and the local revenue staff. In the NWFP where revenue records are maintained centrally the complaints are fewer. Separation between land record management, land revenue collection, land dispute resolution mechanisms may overcome some of the problems in land administration. A separate report is under preparation to address this particular issue.

12. The above analysis does not, by any means, imply that the old system should be restored but the deficiencies, flaws and weaknesses that have emerged in the implementation of the post 2001 system should be examined in an open, dispassionate and holistic manner. Remedial

measures should then be put in place to overcome these deficiencies. The proposed framework articulated in this paper takes the existing post 2001 system as given and anchors the reforms of civil services within the context of the post-devolution system. Some specific recommendations have been separately made by the NCGR for improving the delivery of basic services such as Education, Health and for strengthening the Police and Land Revenue Administration.

OBJECTIVE OF CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS

13. The Objectives of the proposed Civil Service Reforms are two fold:

- (i) to improve the capacity of the civil servants to become responsive in delivering basic public services to the common citizens in an efficient, effective and equitable manner,
- (ii) to attract, retain, motivate and develop high quality civil servants to improve the functioning of all the three tiers of the government.

THE EXISTING SYSTEM

14. The existing arrangements for manning government positions allows posting of personnel from a variety of services and departmental cadres of the federal as well as provincial governments. Consequently, personnel from a variety of services and cadres, such as All-Pakistan Unified Grades (APUG), Federal Unified Grades (FUG), Provincial Civil Service (PCS), Provincial Local Councils Service (LCS) and departmental cadres of the Provincial Government are found right down to the local government offices. These are, in addition, to the Servants of the Local Councils (SOLC), who are the direct employees of the local governments. A brief review of the existing structure of civil services at all levels of government is, therefore, essential for understanding the present arrangements for staffing the governments at the three tiers of the Governments.

Constitutional Provision Regarding Civil Services.

15. The basis for establishment of various Civil Services at the federal and provincial levels has been provided in Article 240 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973, which is reproduced below for ready reference:

"240. Appointment to service of Pakistan and conditions of service: Subject to the Constitution, the appointments to and the conditions of service of persons in the service of Pakistan shall be determined:-

- (a) in the case of the services of the Federation, posts in connection with the affairs of the Federation and All-Pakistan Services, by or under Act of Majlis-e-Shoora [(Parliament)]; and

- (b) in the case of the services of a Province and posts in connection with the affairs of a Province, by or under Act of the Provincial Assembly.

Explanation: In this Article, "All-Pakistan Service" means a service common to the Federation and the Provinces, which was in existence immediately before the commencing day or which may be created by Act of Majlis-e-Shoora [Parliament]".

Civil Services of the Federation

16. **Legal Basis.** Civil Servants Act, 1973 and the Rules made there under provide the legal basis for regulating the appointment to, and the terms and conditions of an All Pakistan Service or a civil service of the Federation or a post in connection with the affairs of the Federation. It applies to all Civil servants of the Federation wherever they may be, in federal government, provincial government, local authority, a corporation or a local body. The NCGR has prepared a set of working papers that attempt to define the Civil Servants in a more precise, clear and consistent manner in the light of the most recent case law developed by the Supreme Court of Pakistan and the agreed views of the Establishment, Finance and Law Divisions and the Provincial Governments. These papers, if approved by the Steering Committee, will have a profound impact on the future evolution of the Civil Services in Pakistan.

17. **Service Structure.** Administrative Reforms of 1973 abolished all classes among the civil servants, merged all services and cadres into a single unified graded structure and prohibited the use of "service" labels. The following three unified grades were created under the new rules (framed on the basis of Civil Servants Act, 1973) which continue to this day:

- a. **All Pakistan Unified Grades (APUG).** The APUG officers are posted to Federal as well as Provincial Governments, including Districts, mostly on posts reserved for them. The APUG comprise the following occupational groups/services:-
- (1). District Management Group. (BPS17 -22).
 - (2). Police Service of Pakistan. (BPS17 – 22).
 - (3). Secretariat Group. (BPS 19 -22).
- b. **Federal Unified Grades (FUG).** As a rule, the FUG officers are posted to the Federal Government posts only. The FUG consist of the following occupational groups: :-
- a. Accounts Group.
 - b. Commerce and Trade Group.
 - c. Customs and Excise Group.
 - d. Foreign Service of Pakistan.
 - e. Income Tax Group.
 - f. Information Group.
 - g. Military Lands & Cantonment Group. *
 - h. Office Management Group. *
 - i. Postal Group.

- j. Railways (Commercial and Transportation) Group.
- k. Economist & Planners Group

***Note:** Fresh induction into groups at (7) & (8) above has been stopped recently with a view to ultimately abolishing these groups:-

Besides the above eleven occupational groups, personnel belonging to the following categories also form part of FUG:-

- (1). **Ex-Cadre Officers (BPS-17) and above.** There are a large number of Federal Government officers whose posts have not been encadred. These officers mainly belong to technical and professional categories, e.g., specialized positions in Ministries of Education, Science & Technology, Food & Agriculture, Population Welfare, Special Education, Communications and a host of Attached Departments, Subordinate Offices, Bureaus, Commissions, Research Organizations, etc. Although they account for 80-90 percent of the officers positions in the Federal Government, the ex-cadre officers enjoy relatively limited career progression compared to en-cadred and occupational groups mentioned above.
- (2). **Subordinate Staff of BS-1 to BS-16.** Subordinate staff of BS-1 to BS-16 are ministry /division /department-specific employees with the exception of Subordinate Accounts Service (SAS) personnel who are routinely posted across ministries /divisions /departments. 95 percent of the positions in the Federal Government ministries/ attached departments/ subordinate offices etc. are occupied by the subordinate staff.

18. **Recruitment Policy.** Recruitment to the federal services/posts is regulated by Civil Servants (Appointment, Promotion and Transfer) Rules, 1973; and Federal Public Service Commission (Functions) Rules, 1978. Recruitment to all federal services/posts at the entry point is made on provincial /regional quota basis, through:-

- c. Federal Public Service Commission for employees of BS-17 and above.
- d. Ministry /Division /Department Recruiting Committees - for employees of BS-1 to BS-16.

Provincial Civil Services.

19. **Legal Provision.** On the basis of Article 240 of the Constitution, separate enactments were made by each Provincial Government in 1973/ 1974 for regulating the appointment to and the terms and conditions of service of persons in, the service of respective provinces. The provincial Civil Servants Act applies to all the civil servants of the respective provinces irrespective of their posting to the provincial government, federal government or any autonomous body.

20. **Structure of Provincial Civil Services.** The 1973 Administrative Reforms also resulted in the merger of all provincial services and cadres into a single unified graded structure called

Provincial Unified Grades (PUG). The existing provincial services / cadres can be divided into the following categories:

- a. **Provincial Civil Services (BS-17 and above).** The Provincial Civil Services (PCS) consist of two branches:
 - (1) PCS Executive Branch. [PCS (EB)]. Extra Assistant Commissioner.
 - (2) PCS Secretariat Branch. [PCS (SB)]. Section Officer.

Note: Quite recently, the Provincial Governments of Punjab and NWFP have decided to merge (1) and (2) into a Provincial Management Service
 - (3) PCS Judiciary Branch. [PCS (JB)]. Magistrates.
- b. **Technical /Professional Services /Cadres (BPS-16 and above).** The Technical/Professional Services/Cadres include Revenue, Accounts, Excise & Taxation, Education, Agriculture, Health, Forestry, Veterinary, Engineering, Information, Law etc. Their recruitment is made through PPSC and service matters are handled by their respective parent departments.
- c. **Subordinate Employees (BS 1-15).** Direct recruitment to posts of BS-1 to BS-15 is generally carried out by the respective departments except for some of the more lucrative posts which are recruited to by PPSC. These posts include Naib Tehsildar, Police Inspector, Sub-Engineer, Sub Registrar (Revenue), Prosecuting Sub Inspector, Asst Jail Superintendent, Cooperatives Inspector, Electricity Sub-Inspector, Food Grain Inspector, etc. Personnel management of these employees is the responsibility of their respective departments except for the employees of the provincial secretariat who are managed centrally by the S & GAD.

21. **Recruitment Policy.** The departmental recruitment committees are responsible for direct recruitment of technical/ professional cadres and subordinate staff. PCS or PMS officers and Technical officers in Grades-16 and above are recruited through Provincial Public Service Commission (PPSC) and put through an initial training of a short duration of 4-6 months before being posted. The service is managed centrally by Services and General Administration Department (S&GAD) of the provinces.

22. **Federal-Provincial Interrelationship.** The APUG officers (Federal Services) are eligible for posting to the provinces on the basis of the following formula for distribution of posts between the provincial services and the APUG:

<u>Grades</u>	<u>APUG</u>	<u>Provincial Officers</u>
BPS-21	65 %	35 %
BPS-20	60%	40%
BPS-19	50%	50%
BPS-18	40%	60%

Civil Service in Local Governments.

23. **Pre-Devolution Scenario.** In the pre-devolution days, the local self-government had a limited scope. Local bodies' functions were restricted mainly to municipal services, animal husbandry services and establishment and maintenance of dispensaries, maternity centers and rural health centers. In a few cases, urban local bodies also undertook establishment and management of education institutions. While most of the officer level staff (BS-16 and above) of the local councils was, and continues to be provided by the Provincial Services, majority of the support staff of BS-1 to BS-7) were the employees of the local bodies. Support staff of BS-8 to BS-15 was being shared between the Provincial Local Councils Service and the Servants of the Local Councils.

24. **Categories of Employees in Local Bodies.** The following three categories of employees were found in the pre-devolution local governments:

- a. **Civil Servants.** The employees are from the Provincial Local Government and Rural Development (LG & RD) Department, and from DMG and PCS cadres.
- b. **Member of the Provincial Local Councils Service (LCS).** The LCS was established under Provincial Local Government Ordinance 1979/80. Recruitment, posting, transfers and all other service matters of LCS were handled by Local Government Board (LGB) comprising Secretary LG Department as the chairman and 3-5 members appointed by the Provincial Government. Secretariat of the LGB acted as the secretariat for the LCS. The LCS comprised employees ranging from BS-5 to BS-20.
 - (i) **Servants of the Local Councils.** Apart from the LCS, Provincial Local Government Ordinance 1979-80 also provided for another category of employees, who were called Servants of the Local Councils (SOLC). They were the direct employees of the local councils responsible for recruitment and personnel management. However, the number of SOLC of each local council and their pay scales were controlled by the Provincial Government.

Post-devolution changes.

25. Since 2001 the Local Government comprises of (a) District Government or City District Government (b) Tehsil Municipal Administration or Town Municipal Administration and (c) Union Administration. Eleven departments – District Coordination, Agriculture, Community Development, Education, Finance & Planning, Health, Income Tax, Law, Literacy, Revenue, Works and Services have been devolved under the Local Government Ordinance to the District Governments. The functions of the offices of Local Government and Rural Departments, Housing, Urban Development and Public Health Engineering Department have been entrusted

to the Tehsil or Town Municipal Administration.

26. Local Government Ordinance 2001 envisages local governments to function within the provincial framework and adhere to the Federal and Provincial Laws. However, the local governments are not subject to direction by the Provincial/Federal government except "for the purpose of preventing any grave threat to public peace and order, handling emergencies, protection and security of the people and the security and integrity of the state". And such directions are to be issued through the concerned Zila Nazim. It thus implies that the local governments are independent in their routine functioning and that any intervention by the provincial government, except in the above stated eventualities, can only be through legislation. In practice however, the hierarchies of the Provincial Government departments are intact and provincial intervention continues informally through network of departmental loyalties. This adversely affects responsiveness of the provincial government employees to the elected head of local administration. On the other hand, the administrative links between the District Government, Tehsil Municipal Administration (TMA) and Union Administration are quite weak.

GUIDING PRINCIPLES.

27. If the diagnosis presented in the receding paragraphs is accepted to be true then the future reforms of the Civil Service should be aimed at addressing the factors outlined. The guiding principles for the Civil Service reforms should therefore be:

- i) Open, transparent, merit-based recruitment to all levels and grades of civil services with Regional Representation as laid down in the constitution.
- ii) Civil Services should be organized to meet the varying demands of Governments at all levels – All Pakistan, Federal, Provincial and Local Governments. The concept of superior services should be done away with and all services, cadres and ex-cadres treated uniformly. Contractual employees should form part of the civil service spectrum.
- iii) Equality of opportunity should be provided, without any reservations or discrimination, for career progression and appointment to senior managerial positions to all members of the Civil Services whether they belong to Services, Cadres, Occupational groups and ex-cadre positions.
- iv) Standards, eligibility criteria, assessment methods, and selection procedures should be equally rigorous for all new entrants whether recruited by the Federal or the Provincial Governments.

- v) Post-induction, in service, on-the-job training should be imparted to all Civil Servants and explicitly linked to their promotion. Specialized and professional training will be given equal weight as managerial training.
- vi) Performance evaluation system should be redesigned and reoriented. Goals, targets and key performance indicators should be agreed upon and performance of the individual appraised against these benchmarks in an open, consultative manner. The purpose of the performance evaluation should be to build on the strengths of the individual and help him/ her to overcome weaknesses. The principle of confidentiality in performance report should be dispensed with.
- vii) A living wage and compensation package including decent retirement and other welfare benefits should be made available.
- viii) Security of tenure of office for a specified period of time should be strictly observed and civil servants given legal protection against arbitrary acts that do not conform to due process of law
- ix) Career progression should be based on performance on the job, training outcomes and skill upgradation and demonstration of potential rather than on seniority-cum-fitness criteria.
- x) Efficiency and Discipline Rules should be revised to allow officers to take initiative, solve problems and be held accountable for results rather than to go through the rituals and processes.
- xi) Rules of business, Estacode, Financial and Audit Rules have to be revised and powers delegated so that the Secretaries and heads of departments are fully empowered to take decisions.
- xii) Audit function should be strengthened whereby financial accountability of the Secretary or head of the department is established while he/ she is in office. The present practice of submitting reports to Public Accounts Committee (PAC) when the responsible Secretary has retired or moved on dilutes the accountability.
- xiii) Secretaries Committees at the Federal and the Provincial Governments should be used more frequently for coordination, consultations, articulation of diverse view points and dispute resolution among various ministries/ departments and display of leadership qualities.

28. Keeping the above guiding principles in mind there are several strategic options that can be analyzed to organize the Civil Services in the future. This paper has focused on two of such options for eliciting stakeholder views.

STRATEGIC OPTIONS

Option – I

29. All civil servants in BPS 17-22 (precisely defined and conforming to the Civil Servants Act, 1973 and the rules thereunder) serving at the Federal, Provincial and Local Governments as described in paras 16-23 above should be merged and organized into a number of All Pakistan Services and cadres. For example, in addition to merging the existing services and cadres at the Federal and Provincial levels into All Pakistan Services/ cadres, new services and cadres such as Education, Health, Agriculture, Irrigation, Works and Housing etc. could be created as All Pakistan Services/ cadres encompassing all the civil servants serving at the Federal, Provincial and Local Governments – into unified groups. The officers belonging to these services/ cadres can be moved from one province to other and from the Federal to the Provincial and to the local governments after different prescribed intervals of time. All these cadres that have minimum critical mass would have a pyramidal structure and career progression will take place within the cadres according to transparent promotion policy that is identical across the cadres. Equal opportunities for promotion to higher positions will be available to all civil servants irrespective of their initial appointment. Under this option the structure of the civil services would be organized on the following illustrative lines:

- (i) Pakistan Management Service (Combining DMG, Secretariat, PMG)
- (ii) Police Service of Pakistan
- (iii) Pakistan Foreign Service
- (iv) Pakistan Taxation Service
- (v) Pakistan Audit and Accounts Service
- (vi) Pakistan Engineering Service (Combined or Separate for each category)
 - a. Civil (Works & Housing)
 - b. Irrigation
 - c. Roads and Highways
 - d. Public Health Engineering
- (vii) Pakistan Education Service
 - a. All management positions in Education Ministry/ Education Departments
- (viii) Pakistan Health Service
 - a. All management positions in Health Ministry/ Health Departments
- (ix) Pakistan Agriculture Service
- (x) Pakistan Legal Service
- (xi) Pakistan Economist Service

30. The exact number of Services and Cadres under this option would be quite extensive as for example the aggregation of Civil Engineers (Works and Housing) from all the Federal Government, Provincial and Local Governments would be able to generate a sizeable self standing single cadre. In that event the Pakistan Engineering Service can be carved out into three

or four independent service cadres. Some of the cadres that are not feasible at present would attain the critical strength at All Pakistan Level.

31. Officers and Staff in Grades 1-16 will be employed at the Federal, Provincial and Local Governments and retain their distinct positions and move within the Governments by which they were recruited. Officers in Grade 16 will be eligible for recruitment to All Pakistan Services through a competitive examination and their qualifications, experience performance record and training will also be taken into account for determining eligibility and suitability for promotion and final induction.

32. The number of services cadres can be determined once a survey is carried out of the strength of existing employees working under each category throughout Pakistan all three tiers of the Government. This configuration will, however, entail a very powerful and effective Central Personnel Management Agency that is responsible for the recruitment, training, promotion, discipline, postings and transfers of All Pakistan Services/ Cadres. Even assuming that the operational responsibilities for Service/ Cadre management are delegated to the respective line ministries the Central Agency will still have a critical role in policy development and regulation, ensuring consistency in application of the policies, monitoring and enforcement and redressal of grievances.

33. The advantages and disadvantages of this option are:

Advantages:

- a. All civil servants will belong to a regularly constituted uniform national cadre and the existing discrimination between cadre and ex-cadre services, Federal and Provincial Civil Servants will disappear.
- b. There will be equality of opportunity for career progression for all professionals, technical and generalist officers and the elimination of entitlement culture will improve performance on the job and efficiency of the civil servants.
- c. National cohesion and integration will be promoted as officers occupying pivotal positions would have a broader outlook and insights into the specific problems faced by different regions of the country.

Disadvantages

- a. The proposed structure will promote and encourage centralization and go against the grain of devolution of powers and control over their affairs by the Provincial and Local Governments.
- b. The intercadre rivalries and jealousies among the various cadres and too narrow focus on their own disciplines will discourage an integrated

decision making process and reinforce silo- like compartmentalized behavior by the ministries/ departments.

- c. The existence of sub-specializations among the professional staff brought together under single cadre may encourage a culture of entitlement and reservation. For example, the Economist Service would have International Trade, Labour, Macroeconomist, Education Economist etc. and each of these sub-specialists may demand sharing of the limited higher positions in the cadre in a certain pre-assigned ratio.

Option – II.

34. A four tier structure of civil services may be constituted on the following lines

- a. All Pakistan Services - BPS 17-22 Occupational Groups
BPS 20-22 National Executive Service
 - b. Federal Civil Service - BPS 17-22
 - c. Provincial Civil Service - BPS 17-22
 - d. District Civil Service - BPS 01-16
- (a). **All Pakistan Services.** Two of the existing APUG cadres – the District Management Group (DMG) and Police Service of Pakistan (PSP) should continue to be retained with the DMG being renamed as Pakistan Administrative Service (PAS). Current and future positions in the Federal and the Provincial Secretariats Group should be transformed into a National Executive Service (NES) which will man the positions of the Federal and the Provincial Secretariat from Grades 20-22. Recruitment to NES will be made directly through the Federal Public Service Commission and all officers of the Federal, Provincial, District Governments as well as outsiders will be eligible to compete at the NES examination. Adherence to Provincial/ Regional quotas will be observed in recruitment to the NES and this will help promote a sense of participation and ownership among all the provinces and ensure their representation at higher levels of policy making at the Federal Government. Once they are selected to NES they will sever connections with their previous cadre and become part of the NES. Those who do not wish to compete for NES or would like to continue in their own cadres will have the possibility to rise to highest positions in these cadres.

The NES will consist of four specialized cadres i.e Finance and Economic Management, Social Sector Management, Regulatory Management and General Management. Posts in the Federal and Provincial Secretariats would be identified which will be manned by officers of these four specialized cadres. The underlying principle will not be grouping of ministries/ departments but assignment of posts in each Ministry. For example, although the Ministry of Interior may fall in the General Management category but the Chief Finance Officer of the Ministry would always be a member of the Finance and Economic Management cadre of the NES. The Chief Human Resource Officer in the Ministry of Finance will be picked from the General Management cadre and so on.

The positions of Tehsil/ Town Municipal Officers (Grade-17), Executive and District Revenue Officers, District Planning Officers, District Finance Officers, District Coordination Officers, and other relevant positions at the level of the Provincial and Federal Government would be grouped together under the PAS and

shared with the PMG. The positions of Grades 17-19 in the Federal and Provincial Secretariats such as Principal Staff Officer, Staff Officer, etc. will also be open to the officers of PAS and in the provinces to the officers of PMS.

The Police Service of Pakistan (PSP) will have new efficiency and discipline, promotion, training, posting rules in accordance with the new Police Order. The emphasis will be on inculcating and encouraging professionalism and courteous and helpful behavior towards citizens by the police officers. The re-opening of the question whether police is a Provincial or Federal subject so soon after the Police Reforms is not advisable.

(b). **Federal Services.** It is proposed that the following Federal Services should be retained in view of their relative importance and connection to the affairs entrusted to the Federal Government:

1. Pakistan Foreign Service
2. Pakistan Taxation Service
 - a) Customs Cadre
 - b) Inland Revenue Cadre
3. Pakistan Audit and Accounts Service

The following services/ cadres will be retained with the present incumbents and their terms and conditions remaining intact. These services/ cadres will, however, not be open to fresh recruitment in the future through the C.S.S examination;

1. Pakistan Railways Service
2. Pakistan Postal Service
3. Commerce and Trade Group
4. Information Group

NOTE: For 3 and 4 the final decisions will be made after a review has taken place.

The detailed reasoning and justification for the discontinuation of fresh recruitment through the CSS examination has been provided in the paper on recruitment approved by the Steering Committee. The corporations/ management boards/ ministries concerned for these subjects will be free to recruit young officers through an open, competitive process and request the FPSC to conduct the competition. But the eligibility criteria, qualifications, experience, content of examination and interview structure will vary according to the specific job requirements of the requisitioning agency. This will provide greater flexibility in recruiting skilled manpower instead of adhering to the strait jacketing that is implicit under a closed cadre system.

EX-CADRE POSITIONS The other question that was explored was whether the specialists serving in the Ministries and organizations dealing with Science and Technology (S&T), Health, Education, Engineering, Economics, Law should be constituted as regular cadres. In our view the S&T organizations should be delinked from the Basic Pay Scales and given autonomy and the terms and conditions should be similar to Strategic Planning Division (SPD) organizations. The Prime Minister has already approved this arrangement in the case of Pakistan Agriculture Research Council (PARC). Health and Education management cadres at the Federal level are too small to form a critical mass essential for encadrement. The Federal Government has successfully transferred operational responsibilities to autonomous bodies and corporations and the regulatory responsibilities to the Regulatory Authorities both of which have the requisite strength of Oil and Gas engineers, water resource engineers, power engineers etc. The residual staff of scattered experts in various

ministries does not land itself to binding into a cohesive or homogenous group. The experience with Economist and Planners Group has not been particularly happy both from the ministries and the incumbents' perspective. After careful consideration it is not considered feasible to transform the ex-cadre specialist and technical staff at the Federal Government level into regularly constituted en-cadred services. But the recruitment, training and career progression opportunities for this large group of civil servants should be made rigorous and brought at par those of the cadre services. It has been observed that most of the staff occupying technical posts are stuck for a long time due to inadequacy of the number of vacancies at higher grades. These experts and specialists are therefore put at a disadvantage for no fault of theirs although they may meet all the requisite criteria for promotion. Due to the arbitrary limits on the number of vacancies available in the technical ministries their path towards career progression is unfairly blocked and hindered. The costs in terms of productivity and efficiency losses caused by poor morale and de-motivation of as many as 80 percent of the officers who are technical experts far exceed the paltry financial savings. This situation needs to be reversed by introducing an alternative system for the ex-cadre staff in which professional growth opportunities are provided in addition to promotion against structured vacancies. Specified criteria such as qualification, experience, training, performance etc. would be laid down and the officers found capable to meet these criteria would be promoted to next grades irrespective of the availability of structured vacancies. The financial implications of this professional growth promotion route would be quite insignificant but the benefits in terms of better morale and higher productivity of specialized and skilled staff are likely to be substantial.

- (c). **Provincial Civil Services.** Most of the day to day interaction of an ordinary citizen with the Government functionaries takes place at the District or Tehsil level. But the face of the Government in front of Patwari, Thanedar, Darogha, and other law paid, ill-trained poor mannered government functionaries enjoying enormous discretionary powers is not very helpful. Effective supervision of these officials and chain of control over them have broken down due to politicization of these positions.

It is, therefore, essential that these posts are upgraded and replaced by officers directly recruited at Grade 17 levels by the Provincial Government and E-governance is introduced to facilitate the delivery of public services to the citizens.

The Provincial Civil Services should have several components such as:

- i. Provincial Management Service (PMS)
- ii. Provincial Executive Service (PES)
- iii. Provincial Technical Services Cadres such as Irrigation, Communications, Education, Health, Police etc.
- iv. Provincial Judicial Service (PJS)
- v. Subordinate Employees (Grade 1-16)

The constitution of technical cadres would vary according to the specific circumstances of each province. For example, it is possible that Punjab may have a minimum critical strength for a regular cadre that provides adequate number of posts in higher grades for career progression and promotion path to higher positions of responsibility. In Balochistan, these criteria may not be fulfilled and most of technical departments may continue to have ex-cadre positions. In that event, like the Federal Civil Services the alternative system of professional growth promotion may also be introduced for these positions and opportunities for progression are equalized between cadre and ex-cadre officers.

The Provincial Management Service would fill in the positions at Tehsil, District, Provincial Government level of generalist nature such as Tehsil Municipal Officer (TMO), Deputy District Officer (DDO), Executive District Officer (EDO), District Officer (DO) in Revenue, Finance, Planning, Community Development Departments and the incumbents can progress all the way upto Grade 22 in the Provinces. These cadre positions will be shared with the officers of PAS.

The Provincial Executive Service will be constituted on the lines of the National Executive Service. A competitive examination by PPSC will be held for recruitment to PES and will be open to the officers of PMS, Provincial technical cadres and ex-cadre posts at Grade 18. Those meeting the eligibility criteria including performance record and are successful at the examination will be inducted into the PES at Grade 20 level. PES and NES officers will have equal shares in all the Provincial Secretariat positions from Grade 20 to 22. Officers of PMS, PAS, ex-cadres, PTS etc. will be eligible to occupy positions at Grades 17-19 in the Provincial Secretariat. District Service officers of Grade 17 will also be eligible for these positions.

- (d). **District Service.** The enabling legislative framework for the creation of District Service is provided in the Local Government Ordinances 2001. The law clearly stipulates that “the District Government shall be responsible to the people and the Government for improvement of governance and delivery of services within the ambit of the authority decentralized to it under this ordinance”. The Zila Nazim heads the District Government with the assistance of the District Coordination Officer (DCO). The Executive District Officers of the eleven (11) devolved departments report to the DCO. The effectiveness and scope of control exercised by DCO is limited in practice by the powers specified to him i.e of coordination only and in the absence of any administrative links with the lower tiers of the Tehsil or Town Administration. The actual implementation of all the provisions of the law has stalled due to lack of consensus between the Provincial and the Federal Governments. Although eleven (11) departments have been devolved to the District Governments most of the positions are still manned by the Provincial Civil Servants. As an immediate measure, it is proposed that:
- i) the District Cadres comprising all Grade 1-16 posts at the District, Tehsil and Union level may be constituted for those departments where there is a minimal critical strength and viable pyramidal structure for progression. In City District Governments it may be possible to include Grade-17 officers of several departments in the District Service Cadres.
 - ii) the teachers and health workers should be appointed on contract by the facility itself for a specific period. These posts should be excluded from the regular Provincial and District Cadres.
 - iii) this phase-I of District Service Cadre should be evaluated after five years of experience and a decision may then be taken for including Grade-17 and above officers in this cadre. It is also possible to have Regional Cadres where a group of Districts agrees to form the Regional Cadre from where posts of Grade-17 and above could be filled in. The formation of Regional Cadres may provide a solution to the tension between a centralized Provincial Cadre and low critical mass of the smaller District Cadres.
 - iv) the post of District Coordination Officer may be re-designated as District Chief Operations Officer (DCO) and the current relationship that exists between the CM and CS in respect of the Provincial Government may be replicated at the District level in terms of functions, responsibilities, authority, powers, and accountability. The posts of DCO for City District

Governments will be in Grade-22, in major district Grade-21 and in smaller districts Grade-20.

- v) the Tehsil Municipal Officer (TMO) should be the Chief Operating Officer of the Tehsil/ Town Administration (TMA) working under the direct control of Tehsil/ Town Nazims but report for coordination purposes to the DCO. He/ She can be designated as ADCO for this purpose. The staffing of the TMAs should be upgraded by recruiting higher grade officers of professional competence, caliber and attitude alongwith automation of processes, forms, applications etc.

35. The advantages and disadvantages of option-II are:

Advantages:

- a. The Provincial and District Governments would be able to attract good quality Civil Servants at par with the Federal Government.
- b. The on going process of decentralization, devolution and de-concentration of powers would be aided by the availability of human resources of the right kind at all levels of government, better administrative coherence and quicker response capacity to citizens.
- c. There will be minimum dislocation as most of the essential features of the existing system have been retained and the resistance to the new proposals is not expected to be that stiff.

Disadvantages

- a. Incremental approach proposed for reforming the Civil Service may not fully remedy the deficiencies existing in the system.
- b. The Federal Government that is responsible for highest policy making in the country may lose some of its talent and therefore its capabilities may be eroded.
- c. The proposals are highly dependent on the speed with which e-government is introduced and any delays – deliberate or otherwise – may slow down the proposed reforms.

PROPOSED FRAMEWORK

PREFERRED OPTION.

36. After analyzing the merits and de-merits of the two options, taking the sense of the broad Government policy direction, the views of most of the stakeholders and taking into account the functions of the state it is proposed that the following formally constituted and encadred services should be retained or established at different levels of the government.

- All Pakistan**
- (i) National Executive Service (NES)
 - (ii) Pakistan Administrative Service (formerly DMG)
 - (iii) Police Service of Pakistan (PSP)

- Federal**
- (i) Pakistan Foreign Service (PFS)

- (ii) Pakistan Audit and Accounts Service (PAAS)
- (iii) Pakistan Taxation Service with two cadres for Customs and Inland Revenue (PTS)

- Provincial**
- (i) Provincial Management Service (PMS)
 - (ii) Provincial Executive Service. (PES)
 - (iii) Provincial Technical or Professional Service (PTS)
 - (iv) Provincial Judicial Service (PJS)

- District** District Service

37. In addition to the above services the ex-cadre positions and subordinate services (Grade 1-16) will be retained. A detailed discussion of the subordinate services follows. But another new class of employees i.e contract employees will be introduced at all levels starting with MP-I.

38. It has been suggested by some quarters that the recruitment to NES should take place at Grade-17 instead of Grade-20 and the positions in PAS cadre at 17 to 19 grades become part of the NES. The Secretariat positions and the sub-cadres proposed for inclusion in the NES grades 20-22 can then draw upon officers both (i) through promotion from among those who were directly recruited in the NES at Grade-17 level and (ii) for all other services through an examination and interview from Grade-19 to Grade-20. It is argued that this route may attract high quality young men and women to opt for the civil services due to their assured fast track career prospects. However, this particular suggestion violates two of the guiding principles that have been laid out at the beginning of this paper to underpin the re-organization of civil services. First, it is a negation of the principle of equality of opportunity as a sub-set of the officers recruited into grade-17 will have preferential access to the NES jobs. Second, the past bickering, and inter-service rivalries will re-surface making it difficult to keep the large body of civil servants motivated and productive. Finally, the elements of contestability and competition for higher positions should keep everyone on toes to make their best efforts minimizing the sense of complacency that is ingrained in any scheme of reservation or entitlement. Empirical evidence does not substantiate the proposition that the success at a single examination at a young age is a strong predictor of success in the professional career in absence of continuous training and skill up-gradation and progression based on competition, performance and merit.

39. The major changes proposed in this new framework compared to the present system are as follows:

- (i) All cadres and occupational groups will have a uniform nomenclature i.e service.

- (ii) A new All Pakistan Service – the National Executive Service (NES) along with the Provincial Executive Service (PES) will be constituted for each province for filling senior positions (Grade 20-22) in the Federal/ Provincial Secretariat and other identified select key positions in other attached departments/ autonomous bodies/ corporations. The NES/ PES will be open to all existing officers serving the Government and also to the professionals from outside meeting certain eligibility criteria. Regional/ Provincial quotas for recruitment to NES will address the complaints of smaller provinces for non-representation at Secretary/ Additional Secretary levels in the Federal Government.
- (iii) Fresh recruitment to some of the existing cadres and occupational groups proposed in this paper e.g Railway Service, Postal Service etc. will be discontinued through the CSS examination and substituted by competitive recruitment of requisite skilled manpower through FPSC or other transparent and open modes.
- (iv) A new District Service encompassing posts of Grades 1-16 will be established for each district or group of districts will be formed in the first phase. Article 240 of the Constitution of Pakistan stipulates that there would be All Pakistan, Federal and Provincial Services. The constitution does not mention a District Service. In view of the fact that most of the interaction of a common citizen takes place at the district level such a properly constituted and well trained group of civil servants is essential at the District level. For City District Governments the District Service can be extended to include Grade 17 officers. These District Service officers will share the posts with the Provincial and APUG officers.
- (v) Separate cadres of Inland Revenue and Customs will be retained but become components of the Pakistan Taxation Service.
- (vi) District Management Group would be renamed as Pakistan Administrative Service.
- (vii) Provincial Technical and Professional Services with multiple cadres such as, Education, Health, and Engineering Services etc. will be set up by each province where the critical mass and viable pyramidal structure criteria are met.
- (viii) Contract, short term, part time employment and the use of consultants would be encouraged to fill in the skill gaps or perform jobs of exceptional or non-repetitive specialized nature.

40. The Commission is fully cognizant of the fact that both the number of candidates as well as the quality of successful applicants at the Central Superior Services examinations have deteriorated in recent years. There are a number of factors contributing to this trend e.g:

- (1) A buoyant private sector particularly in the financial services, telecom, IT, electronic media, oil and gas is offering more attractive opportunities at the entry level.
- (2) A large number of scholarships and fellowships for studies abroad provided by the HEC and the introduction of Tenure Track System with high starting salaries are diverting some of the potential candidates towards teaching as a career.
- (3) The uncertain prospects, unsettled terms and conditions, and underpaid compensation package of civil services have discouraged otherwise eligible candidates from applying for the CSS.

The framework proposed above will work only if the entire value chain of human resources management and development proposed by the NCGR i.e recruitment, training, promotion, performance appraisal, compensation, severance, welfare and post retirement benefits is targeted for up-gradation in a holistic manner. Partial selection from the value chain will not produce the desired results. Of course, the time path for implementation has to be phased out but the end-goal and the direction should be clearly spelled out at the outset so that the civil services can once again become an occupation of choice by some of the bright, talented but public-service oriented young men and women of the country. Expectations should, however, be tempered by the fact that the quest and reminiscences about the past are likely to prove unrealistic and inappropriate for the future as the dynamics of State-Market-Society relationship has undergone and is undergoing fundamental changes.

SUBORDINATE SERVICES (Grade 1-16)

41. Under either of the two options the future of the Subordinate Services has to be analyzed and pinned down as this group of employees will continue to play a supporting role but of different kind compared to the past and current situation. A very large proportion of the annual wage, salaries, allowances and benefits budget of the government employees accrues to the staff employed in Grade 1-16. In terms of sheer numbers it is estimated that 90-95 percent of all civil servants at the three tiers belong to subordinate services.

42. At the Federal Government 85 percent of the salary and wage bill of the Ministries/ attached departments subordinate offices is disbursed to this category of employees and only 15 percent to the officers in BS 17 and above. The Federal Government, for example, has as many

as 234,000 employees sanctioned posts (208,000 actually working) in BPS 1-5. A question may be asked whether this large pool (almost 60 percent of the Federal Government employees) in a largely unskilled category would be required once the e-office suite is introduced in all the Ministries/ Departments as the horse engine for conducting government business. It is quite conceivable that new skills that do not exist at present in the Government at the Support Staff level may be required for future business. The existing staff members should be given opportunities for retraining to acquire of the needed skills. Even after that, if redundancies become apparent the planning for meeting those redundancies in the outer years should start now and all the vacancies likely to become surplus to the requirements in the future should be frozen and no new recruitment be allowed against those posts. This natural attrition would prepare the Federal Government to reach its envisaged target in a manner that does not threaten the livelihoods of the employees. Staff welfare and protection should remain an important criterion for the Government in evaluating its alternatives and forced or voluntary separation should be avoided as much as possible. These low income employees do not possess marketable skills and therefore their absorption elsewhere in the economy would be highly doubtful.

43. A rough estimate of the Provincial Government employees also indicates that 85 percent of the salary and wage bill is allocated to three departments – Education, Health and Police. These departments will expand in future as the facilities and services are extended and new recruitment is made either on contract or regular basis to fill in the new vacancies. Outside these departments the Provincial Governments and District Governments may have to examine in light of e-government initiative the optimal size of support staff which will be required to sustain their operations. This review may lead to the conclusion that there would be surplus staff in several categories in year 5. Action will have to be initiated immediately to freeze recruitment to the vacancies against surplus posts occurring due to attrition. Second, the upgradation of SHO to Grade 17 officer by combining some of the urban Thanas or Tehsil Land Record Officer in place of a number of Patwaris or similar other positions that interface with the general public may also force freezing of new recruitment against these redundant posts. The NCGR can also provide the broad guidelines but in depth review have to be carried out by each Provincial/ District Government.

44. Entry points to Subordinate Services should be few so that there are good prospects for promotion across the BPS grades. It is suggested that fresh induction should take place at the following Grades:

a.	BPS-1	Through Departmental Sectional Boards, automatic promotion on Seniority-cum-Fitness basis upto BPS-4
b.	BPS-5	50 percent of vacancies for new entrants

		and 50 percent for promotion through an examination conducted by Departmental Selection Boards, automatic promotion on Seniority-cum-Fitness basis upto BPS-10
c.	BPS-11	60 percent of vacancies for new entrants and 40 percent for promotion through an examination by the Departmental Selection Boards, automatic promotion on Seniority-cum-Fitness basis upto BPS-13
d.	BPS-14	70 percent of vacancies for new entrants and 30 percent through an examination and interview by Departmental Selection Boards, automatic promotion to BPS-16
e.	BPS-17	80 percent of vacancies for new entrants and 20 percent for promotion through an examination and interview conducted by FPSC and PPSC

SUPPORT SYSTEMS FOR CIVIL SERVICES

45. Any reforms of Civil Services will remain incomplete if the supporting systems and the enabling environment are also not brought in line with the proposed structure. Empirical experience has shown that the structural changes can hardly make any tangible difference if these are not accompanied by the changes in the support systems. We, therefore, recommend that the following reforms in the support systems should be implemented pari passu with the structural reforms in the civil services that have been outlined in the preceding paragraphs. The NCGR is working on several of these measures in collaboration with many different parts of the Federal/ Provincial Governments. But there is an immediate need to bring all these initiatives together, weave them together into an integrated plan, track and monitor their progress and intervene at the highest level (PM or CM or the Cabinets) where remedial measures or complementary actions are required. The list below is preliminary in nature and will be further refined in light of the comments received from the various stakeholders.

- a. Re-organization of the Federal and Provincial Government structures on the lines proposed by NCGR.
- b. Introduction of E-office suite and E-government standards applications and automation of business processes. (E-Government Directorate, Ministry of I.T).
- c. Strengthening of the Public Service Commissions particularly the Provincial Commissions. (Federal/ Provincial Public Service Commissions, Establishment Division/ S&GA Departments).

- d. A Transparent Promotion Policy with clearly defined role of the Selection Boards/ Departmental Promotion Committees and pre-announced criteria of eligibility and selection (NCGR/ Establishment Division)
- e. New system of Performance Appraisal, job descriptions, skill profiling, goal setting. (NCGR/ Management Service Wing (MSW))
- f. Revision of Estacode, General Financial Rules, Treasury Rules, Fundamental Rules, Supplementary Rules, Pension Rules, Financial Powers Delegation. (NCGR/ Management Service Wing (MSW)/ Finance Division)
- g. Establishment of Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) in place of the Auditor General of Pakistan. (NCGR/ Finance Division/ Auditor General)
- h. Transformation of Establishment Division into a modern agency for management and development of human resources in the Federal Government. (NCGR/ Establishment Division)
- i. Revision of compensation and benefit packages. (Pay & Pension Committee/ NCGR)
- j. Legal remedies and protection of civil servants' rights. (Secretaries Committee)
- k. Strong Internal Control system by Finance, Establishment and Law Ministries. (Secretaries Committee)
- l. Upgrading and setting up Training and Policy research institutions. (NCGR/ Establishment Division/ S&GA Departments)
- m. Enhancing welfare of Civil Servants through better use of – Pension, Benevolent Fund, G.P Fund, Medical facilities, Post-retirement housing and benefits (NCGR/ Establishment Division/ Finance Division/ Housing & Works Division)
- n. Streamlining the ombudsman institution and introducing Alternate Dispute Resolution (ADR) mechanism more widely. (Federal Ombudsman)
- o. Providing due process to the civil servants from exercise of arbitrary powers of apprehension and prosecution enjoyed by the National Accountability Bureau (NAB) and giving the civil servants ample opportunity to confront adverse reports on integrity from intelligence agencies. (Secretaries Committee/ NAB/ Central Selection Board)

46. Separate issues papers have been prepared or are at different stages of preparation. These papers will be considered by the NCGR after consultation with the stakeholders.

ISSUES FOR DISCUSSION BY THE NCGR

- (i) Will the proposed framework of civil services outlined in paras 34-36 achieve the goals set out and overcome the deficiencies in the existing set-up?
- (ii) What should be a realistic time plan for implementation of this framework including a transition plan?
- (iii) Which organization should be assigned the task for overseeing and monitoring the overall implementation of this plan? What tools and authority will be available to this organization? Who will prepare and implement the transition plan?
- (iv) Are the agencies/ units shown as responsible for the different components of the Support System in the above para relevant or other changes be made?
- (v) Action should be initiated by the Government on the Pay and Pension Committee recommendations that have already been reviewed by NCGR.